

Examining Culturally Responsive Education in Turkey through Strategic Plans

Gurkan SARIDAS* Funda NAYIR**

To cite this article:

Saridas, G., & Nayir, F. (2022). Examining culturally responsive education in Turkey through strategic plans. *Journal of Qualitative Research in Education*, 31, 85-111. doi: 10.14689/enad.31.1604

Abstract: The strategic plan, which specifies the activities planned to be achieved by an institution in a certain period of time, is very important for the future actions of the institution. The purpose of this research was to find out culturally responsive educational activities in Turkey as specified in the strategic plans prepared by Ministry of National Education, and national education directorates at province and district level. Within the scope of the research, the 2019-2023 strategic plans of 72 school directorates (12 provinces and 36 districts) as well as the Ministry of National Education were examined in terms of culturally responsive education. In this descriptive qualitative study, document analysis method was used. According to the findings of the research, it was understood that culturally responsive education practices were not included enough in the strategic plans, and foreign students were mentioned in the section of weakness, risk or threat. Similarly, targets that would either increase the enrolment rate of foreign students or ensure the academic and social development of foreign students were not encountered in the strategic plans. It is suggested that, culturally responsive educational practices should be included in strategic

Keywords: Strategic plan, foreign students, culturally responsive education, multiculturalism

Article Info

Received: 20 Oct. 2020 Revised: 11 Mar. 2022 Accepted: 23 Mar. 2022

Article Type

Research

© 2022 ANI Publishing. All rights reserved.

^{*} Corresponding Author: Ministry of National Education, Turkey, theapeiron@gmail.com

^{**} Pamukkale University, Turkey, fnayir09@gmail.com



Introduction

Recent increase in the migration rate has increased cultural diversity and resulted in the coexistence of communities with different cultural backgrounds. While these immigrant communities interacted with local communities in some places, they have kept themselves isolated and preserved their own culture. With this transition from locality to universality, there have been various changes in communities (Kastoryano, 2018). Education is one of the most common issues considering these multicultural communities, since education and training policies and practices in the emerging new cultural structures are a matter of debate (Gay & Howard, 2000; Ladson-Billings, 1992). The formation of a multicultural structure in more than half of the education systems causes the educational processes to be structured in a way that is sensitive to cultural values (European Commission/EACEA/Eurydice, 2019). Managing educational learning processes in a sensitive way to cultural values is important in terms of helping to ensure cultural integration in education (Gay, 2002). Culturally responsive education is sensitive to cultural values and gives importance to diversity in the classroom. Education sensitivity to cultural values can be defined as supporting the social and academic needs of students with cultural differences (APA, 2002; Resnicow, 2000). responsive education, students' cultural values are taken into consideration in all education and training processes. (Kotluk & Kocakaya, 2018). Culturally responsive educational practices create high expectations for the social and academic development of the student (Saridas & Nayir, 2020). In order to achieve this, education plans are supposed to be responsive to cultural values.

Turkey has a multicultural structure in terms of language, religion and ethnicity arising from its internal structure. Besides the official language Turkish, Kurdish and Arabic are among the most widely spoken languages. In addition to the Muslim, Christian and Jewish diversity in terms of religious belief, it is also seen that there are sectarian differences such as Sunni and Alawite (KONDA, 2006). This multicultural structure is also increasingly diversified with immigrants from other countries. According to data from the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR, 2019), Turkey hosts immigrants including 3.6 million Syrian, 170 thousand Afghan, 142 thousand Iraqi, 39 thousand Iranian, 5 thousand 7 hundred Somalia and 11 thousand 7 hundred other citizens. This diversity also affects the education system and reveals the importance of culturally responsiveness. At this point, various concepts, projects, programs or activities related to immigrants living in Turkey should be diversified, teacher development models should be created, educational and training materials should be developed, and various policies should be worked on to address the problems of immigrants (Cirik, 2008). It is becoming increasingly important to plan policies and practices towards immigrants in Turkey, to solve the problems encountered and to take preventive measures. This highlights the importance of planning that guides education policies.

Educational planning is the process of deciding on ways to provide and use the necessary inputs for the school to achieve its educational, organizational and



administrative goals. (Basaran & Cinkir, 2011). Studies on Educational Planning, which began in the early years of the Republic in Turkey (Karakutuk, 2012), and then continued with development plans (Kucuker, 2010). After 1980, educational planning began to be used together with the concept of strategic plan (Ansari, 1999). The strategic plan (Eren, 2000), the longest-term planning of an organization, is an outline of the organization's future long-and short-term performance goals and strategies (Thompson & Strickland, 1996).

According to the Strategic Management in the Public (2018) guide, strategic plans are prepared specifically for the organization and include the organization's future goals, objectives, strategic works to be done to achieve these goals, and action plans. Strategic plans also include opportunities and threats that apply to the organization, as well as the strengths and weaknesses of the organization. The aim of an organization's strategic plan is to make a roadmap for a specific period. Environmental or intra-organizational changes require constant updating and updating of these plans. Changing the strengths or weaknesses of the organization, changing external threats or opportunities, also means changing strategic plans. However, changes in the structure or human resources in an organization can also lead to changes in the goals or objectives of the organization. These reasons mean that valid strategies become invalid. In such cases, new action plans are made against new situations or situations by updating the strategic plan.

The basis of the strategic plan preparation process in schools is based on the Public Financial Management and Control Law No. 5018, which came into force in 2003. In accordance with this law, strategic planning in educational institutions was initiated by the Ministry of Education in 2006 (Arslan & Kucuker, 2016). Under the guidance of the strategic plan preparation program published by the Ministry of National Education (2018a) and the framework strategic plan prepared by the Ministry of National Education in accordance with the central organization, provincial national education directorates create and publish their strategic plans for the specified period. District national education directorates prepare their strategic plans in accordance with the strategic plans of the provincial directorates of national education. School directorates prepare their strategic plans in accordance with the published strategic plans of the district national education directorates. These plans, which are prepared as a requirement of central organization, are prepared within the scope of the objectives of the higher level, within the framework of the action plans to be realized, by considering the characteristics of the organization. During the preparation of the strategic plan, new goals or actions related to the main goal can be added, taking into account the problems, risks and weaknesses of the organization.

The Ministry of National Education (MEB, 2018) has asked for strategic plans to be prepared and published by January 2019 in the circular dated March 9, 2020. At the same time, the strategic planning preparation program was described in detail in the circular. The strategic plan prepared by the ministry was published (MEB, 2019), and then the provincial directorates of National Education, District directorates of National Education and institutions prepared their strategic plans and published them on their



official websites. In line with these strategic plans, steps to be taken until 2023 have been determined.

Regarding the multicultural education in Turkey, it can be said that education policies do not clearly define how to focus on the educational processes for culturally responsive education (Cirik, 2008). This is a situation that should be taken into account for the education system, determining future goals and strategies on this issue, in other words, training plans should be made. According to the statement of the Ministry of Education (2020b), 684,919 Syrian students were included in the education system in Turkey in the 2019-2020 academic year. This makes it necessary to develop educational policies and strategies for these students. The current situation about these foreign students and their families in Turkey, their problems and the solutions to these problems, objectives, targets, and strategies are expected to be determined through a strategic plan. It is considered important to examine the strategic plans of the Ministry, provincial and District National education directorates and schools for 2019-2023 period and to reveal an indicators for foreign students in the education and training process. At this point, examining the strategic plans in terms of culturally sensitive education would help in determining the objectives, targets and strategies related to the subject. In this way, information about culturally responsive education and training processes between 2019 and 2023 would be partially revealed and Turkey's culturally responsive education strategies would be determined.

Within the scope of the problem defined so far, the aim of the research was to reveal the works about culturally sensitive education and training activities in Turkey through strategic plans, to determine the works carried out by examining the activities or works in the institution's websites, and to compare the activities and works with the targets in the strategic plans. For this purpose, answers to the following questions were sought.

- 1. What is the extent of culturally responsive educational practices specified in strategic plans prepared by,
 - a) the Ministry of Education?
 - b) the Provincial Directorate of National Education?
 - c) District's National Education Directorate?
 - d) school directorates?
- 2. What are the culturally responsive education practices carried out by
 - a) the Ministry of Education?
 - b) the Provincial Directorate of National Education?
 - c) District's National Education Directorate?
 - d) school directorates?
- 3. Are the practices carried out in educational institutions compatible with the goals specified in the strategic plans in terms of culturally responsive educational practices?



Method

Research Design

The research was a descriptive qualitative study in the survey model and the document analysis method was used. This method covers the analysis of written and oral materials that contain information about topics that are planned to be investigated. Document analysis includes the analysis of written materials containing information about events or facts that are intended to be investigated (Yildirim & Simsek, 2013). The document analysis method is used by historians, anthropologists, linguists, sociologists and psychologists as a method used in many fields and has contributed to the development of important theories. There are powerful and convenient aspects of document analysis, such as the lack of responsiveness, easy access, and the creation of a large sample size. Document analysis process involves the stages of reaching the document, understanding the document, analysing the data and using the data (Karasar, 2000; Yildirim & Simsek, 2013). Within the scope of the research, the strategic plans prepared 2019-2023 by the Ministry of National Education, the Provincial Directorate of National Education, the District Directorate of National Education and schools and published on the websites of the institutions, and the news contents published on the websites of the institutions were examined.

Data Set

The content of the strategic plans for the years 2019-2023 were examined as the data set within the scope of this research. There were a total of 81 provincial directorates of National Education, 922 District Directorates of National Education and 54036 Official School Directorates when the data were collected. Since it was not economical to reach and examine the strategic plans of all these institutions, it was decided to take a sample. The sampling was made according to the statistical regional units in Turkey. The statistical regional units of Turkey have been developed by the European Union (EU) Bureau of Statistics (Eurostat) in order to create a specific structure in the regional statistics to be produced in the EU. This classification has been used since the acceptance of Community Legislation No. 2052/88 on June 24, 1988, which was published in the Official Gazette (EEC) on July 15, 1988 (Sengul, Eslemian & Eren, 2013). Statistical regional units of Turkey show the state of Turkey divided into 12 regions.

These 12 regions were determined according to Turkey statistical units. The 2019-2023 strategic plans of the provincial and district national education directorates and affiliated school directorates, which were selected randomly from these regions, were used as the research data. Accordingly, the strategic plans of total of 12 provincial directorates of national education, one Provincial Directorate of National Education from each region, a total of 36 district directorates of national education, three district directorates of National Education from each province, and a total of 72 school directorates, two



schools from each district were selected for data analysis. Strategic plans of the selected institutions were obtained from the websites of these institutions.

The news content on the websites of the institutions selected as the sample of the research was also examined as a second set of data in order to determine the works and activities carried out by the institutions within the scope of the research.

Data Collection

During the sampling process of strategic plans, the districts or schools that have not yet published any strategic plans or still have its previous strategic plan for 2015-2019 period on their websites were replaced and the strategic plans of other districts or schools were included in the sample.

For ethical purposes, the names of the institutions were kept confidential. For this reason, firstly, the number given by the Turkish Statistical Region Unit was used for the strategic plans of the provincial national education directorates. For example, 1 was assigned to the provincial directorate of national education selected from the region number 1, and the provincial directorate of national education selected from the region numbered 6. Accordingly, the strategic plans of the three sub-provincial directorates of national education were reached and these documents were named with the combination of the number belonging to it and its own number. For example, the plan of the second district assigned with the number 5 was coded as 5-2. Two schools of each district were named after adding to the name of the district they were affiliated to. For example, the 1st school in the 2nd district of the province in the 3rd region was named as 3-2-1. After the naming the schools, the analysis of the data was started.

In order to determine the works and activities carried out by the institutions, the news content on their official websites was examined. At this point it was possible to study the entire population. Since Provincial, District national education directorates' and schools' websites were listed in the extension of the ministry (meb.gov.tr) as a subdomain, it can be easily searched through search engines. For example, "multicultural" site:meb.gov.tr all pages belonging to the ministry where the word "multicultural" was included were displayed when searching the search engine in the form. In this way, it is possible to easily access the news contents of the national education directorates and schools at in provinces or districts.

Data Analysis

By examining the relevant literature, the most commonly used keywords on the subject were determined. These words included "multicultural", "intercultural", "responsive to cultural values", "immigrant", "foreign student", "refugee", "Syrian", "inclusive education" (APA, 2002; Cirik, 2008; Gay, 2002; Ladson-Billings, 1992; Resnicow, Soler, Braithwaite, Ahluwalia, & Butler, 2000). Obtained data were analysed by document

analysis method. Strategic plans were examined using keywords obtained from the literature on document analysis. How many times these words were used in which situations and what strategies were determined for these situations were also examined. The current situation, goals and objectives of the institution's involvement in the strategic plan and the works to be carried out by the institution to achieve these objectives were presented.

Performance reports could be examined to evaluate to what extent the strategic plans are performed successfully. But because these reports were not available, the news on the websites of the institutions was examined. Certain keywords were used to search for news content on institute websites. With these keywords, all websites belonging to the ministry were searched through search engines and news content of works and activities accessed in search results was analysed. Considering that intensive migrant mobility was experienced in 2011 and the first strategic plan made after that year was in 2013, it was expected that concrete steps would be taken in the strategic plan made in 2019 regarding migrants. For this reason, in order to better analyse the results, the content of the last 5 years was examined and the works or activities matching the keywords were analysed.

Validity and Reliability

Validity and reliability criteria used in quantitative research and reported to the reader include credibility, transferability, consistency and confirmability in qualitative research. These four criteria show that qualitative research is valid and reliable (Guba & Lincoln, 2005; Shenton, 2004). It is not expected to meet all of these four criteria for the validity and reliability of a qualitative research. It is noted that one of these criteria is sufficient (Creswell, 2003). In this study, the credibility and transferability criteria were used. Although credibility is related to internal validity, the findings are compatible with reality (Merriam and Tisdell, 2005). For the credibility of the research, a researcher specialized in qualitative research has been asked to monitor the process from the beginning of the research and express his or her views. The transferability criterion is related to external validity (Guba & Lincoln, 2005). At this point, all stages along with the method applied during the research were reported and presented in detail.

Findings

The findings given in this section were examined at the level of Ministry of National Education, Provincial Directorate of National Education, District Directorate of National Education and school directorates for research purposes.

Findings from The Strategic Plan of the Ministry of Education

Findings from The Strategic Plan of the Ministry of Education



Table 1.

Frequency of Keywords Used in The Strategic Plan of The Ministry of Education

| | Multicultural | Intercultural | Culturally Responsiveness | Immigrant | Foreign Student | Refugee | Syrian | Inclusive Education |
|------------------------------------|---------------|---------------|------------------------------|-----------|-----------------|---------|--------|------------------------|
| The Ministry of National Education | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |

According to Table 1, in the relevant strategic plan, the keyword "foreign student" was mentioned once in relation to the schooling rate. The keyword is included in the strategic plan as follows.

Objective 6: "Vocational and technical education and lifelong learning systems will be organized in accordance with the needs of society and the requirements of the labor market and the information age".

Objective 6.4: "In order to improve the quality of work and life of individuals, lifelong learning quality, participation and completion rates will be increased, and activities related to education and training for our citizens abroad will continue."

Performance Indicator 6.4.4: "The schooling rate of foreign students in the 5-17 age group under temporary protection in Turkey (%)

Main responsibility (P.G. 6.4.4): General Directorate of Lifelong Learning

As can be seen, in the strategic plan at the level of the Ministry of Education, only the schooling rate of foreign students was given and this situation was addressed within the scope of lifelong learning. The fact that the ministry has put only one performance indicator to increase the schooling rate for foreign students also raises the question of how the work that will ensure academic and social development for these students will take place.

Works and activities carried out by the Ministry of Education

The works and activities carried out by the Ministry of education within the scope of culturally responsive education were given below:

- Handbook for teachers with foreign students in their class (MEB, 2017)
- Book on school and school management in the context of inclusive education (MEB, 2020)
- Cooperation with universities for foreign students (MEB, 2019a)
- Creation of orientation classes for foreign students (MEB, 2019b)



- Preschool education for foreign students to learn languages before starting primary school (MEB, 2019c)
- Special curriculum for refugee children (MEB, 2020a)
- Education project for all in times of crisis (MEB, 2019d)
- Strengthening the capacity of guidance research centers to provide inclusive educational services (RAMKEG) project (MEB, 2019e)
- QUDRA Program, Management Awareness Training in multicultural educational environments (MEB, 2019f)

When the works or activities carried out by the Ministry of education were examined, it was generally seen that they were carried out for guiding and general-serving purposes. In addition, it was observed that these works were compatible with the performance indicator of increasing the enrollment rate of foreign students in the strategic plan, as well as with various academic and social works.

Findings regarding the Strategic Plans of Provincial National Education Directorates

The information about the frequency of the searched keywords in the strategic plans of the Provincial Directorates of National Education is given in Table 2.

Table 2.Frequency of Keywords in Strategic Plans of Provincial National Education Directorates

| | Multicultural | Intercultural | Culturally Responsiveness | Immigrant | Foreign Student | Refugee | Syrian | Inclusive Education |
|----------------|---------------|---------------|------------------------------|-----------|-----------------|---------|--------|------------------------|
| District No 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| District No 2 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| District No 3 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| District No 4 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| District No 5 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| District No 6 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| District No 7 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| District No 8 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| District No 9 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| District No 10 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| District No 11 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| District No 12 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| Total | 0 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 9 | 2 | 0 | 0 |



According to Table 2, the word "immigrant" was included once in two different strategic plans, the word "foreign student" was included once in seven different plans, twice in other plan, and the word "refugee" was included twice in one strategic plan.

The strategic plan of the keyword "immigrant" with number 8 was as follows:

Objective 3: "Cognitive, emotional and physical multidimensional development of our students will be provided in preschool education and basic education".

Goal 3.1: "The quality and prevalence of Early Childhood Education will be increased, community-based early childhood will be diversified and extended".

Definitions: "In different parts of our province, some families with unfavorable conditions, especially those under temporary protection, immigrants and families with low socioeconomic levels, have problems with access to early childhood education".

Strategic plan number 12, in which the keyword "immigrant" was mentioned as follows:

SWOT Analysis (Strengths and Weaknesses, opportunities and threats) is included in the threats section as "large number of immigrant students".

Strategic plans (excluding Province Number 10) which includes the keyword "foreign student" are as follows:

Objective 6: "Professional and Technical Education and Lifelong Learning Systems, which will be organized according to the competencies required by the needs of society and the demands of the sector, will be implemented effectively".

Target 6.4: "Participation and completion rates of lifelong learning activities will be increased in order to improve the work and life quality of individuals".

Performance Indicator 6.4.4: "The schooling rate of foreign students of the 5-17 age group under temporary protection in our province (%...)"

In addition to the above statements, the keyword "foreign student" was included in strategic plan 7 as follows:

In the table of products and services under the heading of determining the areas of activity and products and services, it is included in the form of "conducting business and operations for the education and training of foreign students".

The keyword "foreign student" was included in strategic plan Number 10 as follows:

In the table of products and services under the heading of determining the areas of activity and products and services, it was included in the form of "conducting business and operations for the education and training of foreign students".

Strategic plan number 12, in which the keyword "refugee" was mentioned follows:



Purpose 4: "Students will be trained to bring solutions to social problems and contribute to the social, cultural and economic development of the country with a secondary education system that prepares students for life and higher education in line with their interests, abilities, and capacities".

Goal 4.1: "Participation and completion rates in secondary education will be increased".

Risks: "Refugee kids under temporary protection who quit secondary school to work to provide economic support to their families ..."

SWOT Analysis (Strengths-Weaknesses, Opportunities-Threats) threatened section under the heading "Turkey's geopolitics is more than the number of refugees due to its location and Turkey is to host asylum seekers from these migration" is situated in the form.

In the strategic plans at the Provincial National Education Level, it was noticed that the access of immigrant students to early childhood education should be expanded, it was seen as a threat to access to education due to the high number of immigrant and refugee students, and that foreign students are included in the objectives of the necessity of carrying out education and training procedures.

Works and activities carried out by the Provincial Directorate of National Education

The works and activities carried out by the Provincial Directorates of National Education within the scope of culturally responsive education are given below.

- Bridge of Civilizations project (Sinop ARGE, 2019)
- Multicultural and multilingual cafe event (Istanbul MEM, 2020)
- Intercultural bridges project to be established with inclusive education (Trabzon ARGE, 2019)
- Inclusive education project for refugee children (Istanbul MEM, 2019)

When the works and activities carried out by the Provincial Directorates of National Education were examined, it was observed that they were generally projects supported by grant projects or implemented throughout the province, as different from those carried out by the Ministry of National Education.

Findings obtained at the level of District National Education Directorates

The information about the frequency of the searched keywords in the strategic plans of the District Directorates of National Education is given in Table 3.



Table 3.

District National Education Directorates Frequency Information of Keywords in Strategic Plans

| | Multicultural | Intercultural | Culturally Responsivenes | s Immigrant | Foreign Student | Refugee | Syrian | Inclusive Education |
|------------------|---------------|---------------|-----------------------------|----------------|--------------------|---------|--------|------------------------|
| District No 1-1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| District No 1-2 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| District No 1-3 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| District No 2-1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| District No 2-2 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| District No 2-3 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| District No 3-1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| District No 3-2 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| District No 3-3 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 0 |
| District No 4-1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 2 | 0 |
| District No 4-2 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 0 |
| District No 4-3 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 0 |
| District No 5-1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| District No 5-2 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| District No 5-3 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| District No 6-1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| District No 6-2 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| District No 6-3 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| District No 7-1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| District No 7-2 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| District No 7-3 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| District No 8-1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| District No 8-2 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| District No 8-3 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| District No 9-1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| District No 9-2 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| District No 9-3 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| District No 10-1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| District No 10-2 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 0 |
| District No 10-3 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| District No 11-1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| District No 11-2 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| District No 11-3 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| District No 12-1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| District No 12-2 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| District No 12-3 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Total | 0 | 0 | 0 | 4 | 28 | 3 | 4 | 0 |



According to Table 3, the word "immigrant" was mentioned once in four strategic plans, the word "foreign student" was mentioned once in twenty-eight strategic plans, the word "refugee" was mentioned three times in three strategic plans, and the word "Syrian" was mentioned once in two strategic plans and twice in one strategic plan.

The keyword "immigrant" was mentioned in strategic plan 4-2as follows:

PESTLE ANALYSIS (Political, Economic, Sociological, Technological, Legal, Ecological) in the category of sociocultural factors "The excess of integration and adaptation problems due to migration." "Raising staff on the subject and accelerating the adaptation of immigrant students and their families to social activities."

The keyword "immigrant" was mentioned in Strategic plans 12-1, 12-2 and 12-3 are as follows:

Objective 3: "Multidimensional development of our students in cognitive, emotional and physical aspects in pre-school education and basic education will be achieved".

Goal 3.1: "The quality and prevalence of early childhood education will be increased, and community-based early childhood education will be diversified and made widespread".

Findings: "Some families with unfavorable conditions, especially those under temporary protection, migrants and families with low socioeconomic status experience problems in accessing early childhood education in different regions of our district".

Mention of the keyword "foreign student" in strategic plans 1-1, 1-2, 1-3, 2-1, 2-2, 2-3, 3-1, 3-2, 3-3,4-1, 7-1, 7-2, 7-3, 8-1, 8-2, 8-3, 9-2, 10-1, 10-2, 10-3, 11-1, 11-2, 11-3, 12-1, 12-2, 12-3 were as follows:

Purpose 6: "Vocational and technical education and lifelong learning systems will be arranged in accordance with the needs of the society and the requirements of the labor market and the information age".

Goal 6.4: "Lifelong learning participation and completion rates will be increased in order to increase the work and life quality of individuals".

Performance Indicator 6.4.4: "Schooling rate of foreign students in the 5-17 age group under temporary protection in our district (%)"

The keyword "foreign student" was mentioned in Strategic plans 4-2, 4-3 and 12-1 as follows:

Under the title of Determination of Fields of Activity and Products and Services, in the Education and Training section, it was stated as "Conducting work and procedures for the education and training of foreign students".

The key word "refugee" was mentioned in the Strategic plans 4-1, 4-2, 4-3 as follows:



Purpose 4: "Students will be trained to bring solutions to social problems and contribute to the social, cultural and economic development of the country with a secondary education system that prepares students for life and higher education in line with their interests, abilities and capacities".

Goal 4.1: "Participation and completion rates in secondary education will be increased".

Risks: "Refugee kids under temporary protection tend to quit secondary school to work to support their families financially"

The keyword "Syrian" is mentioned in the strategic plan 3-3 as follows:

Under the heading of SWOT ANALYSIS, it was stated in the threats section as "the number of Syrian students exceeded the number of local students".

The keyword "Syrian" was mentioned in the strategic plan 4-1 as follows:

Under the heading of Stakeholder Analysis, in the section of determinations "Insufficient teacher training for the integration of Syrian students", "Increasing the number and quality of teacher training for the integration of Syrian students * Organizing congresses-seminars-conferences-panels in order to introduce and disseminate good practices in education" was stated in the section of needs.

The keyword "Syrian" was mentioned in the strategic plan 10-2 as follows:

Under the title of PESTLE Analysis, it was stated in the Social / Cultural Factors section as "The presence of Syrian refugees in the province due to the internal turmoil in Syria, and these refugees in the province negatively affect the economic (workforce and unemployment problem) and social life".

As can be seen, when the strategic plans at the national education level of the district were examined, it was seen that the plans makes an emphasis on the social cohesion of immigrant students. In all three plans, the statement on early childhood education of immigrant students was included, and in all three plans, the statement was included in the same way. The same sentence was used in 28 strategic plans in which the expression of "foreign students" was used, and it was aimed to increase the rate of schooling. The keyword "Foreign student" was included in the three strategic plans in the same way in the goals of conducting business and operations for education and training. The keyword "refugee student" was also included in the three plans and was seen as a risk to migrant students being forced to work to support their families. In one plan, the overpopulation of Syrian students was seen as a threat. Of the 12 plans examined, only the keyword "Syrian student" was used to identify teacher shortages for the integration of these students. Again, in the same plan, the need to increase the number and quality of teacher training was determined in relation to this determination. Finally, in one plan, it has been stated that the Syrian refugees negatively affect the social life.



Works and activities carried out by District National education directorates

As presented below, it was found that only one activity was carried out by the District National Education Directorates. The reflections of the works and activities carried out by the Ministry of National Education or the Provincial Directorate of National Education were excluded from this list.

• Support training program for foreign students (Siverek MEM, 2019)

When the works and activities carried out by the district directorates of national education were examined, it was observed that independent works or activities were not carried out other than those of the Ministry of National Education, the Provincial Directorate of national education to which it was affiliated.

Findings Obtained at the Level of School Directorates

The information about the frequency of the searched keywords in the strategic plans of the school directorates is given in Table 4.

Table 4.Frequency of Keywords in Strategic Plans of School Directorates

| | Multicultura I | Intercultural | Culturally Responsive ness | Immigrant | Foreign Student | Refugee | Syrian | Inclusive Education |
|-----------------|-------------------|---------------|----------------------------------|-----------|--------------------|---------|--------|------------------------|
| 1-1-1 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 1-1-2 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 1-2-1 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 1-2-2 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 1-3-1 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 1-3-2 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 0 |
| 2-1-1 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 2-1-2 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 2-2-1 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 |
| 2-2-2 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 2-3-1 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 2-3-2 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 3-1-1 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 3-1-2 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 3-2-1 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 3-2-2 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 3-3-1 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 3-3-2 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 4-1-1 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 4-1-2 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 4-2-1 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |



| 4-2-2 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
|--------------------------------------|---|---|---|---|------------|---|---|---|
| 4-3-1 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 4-3-2 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 5-1-1 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 5-1-2 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 5-2-1 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 5-2-1 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 5-3-1 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 5-3-1 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 6-1-1 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 6-1-2 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 6-2-1 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| | | | | | | | | |
| 6-2-2 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 6-3-1 School No | 0 | | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 6-3-2 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 7-1-1 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 7-1-2 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 7-2-1 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 7-2-2 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 7-3-1 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 7-3-2 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 8-1-1 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 8-1-2 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 8-2-1 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 8-2-2 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 8-3-1 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 8-3-2 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 9-1-1 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 9-1-2 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 9-2-1 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 9-2-2 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 9-3-1 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 9-3-2 School No 10-1-1 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| | | 0 | | 0 | 0 | | 0 | 0 |
| 10-1-2 School No 10-2-1 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 0 |
| 10-2-1 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 10-3-1 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 10-3-1 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 11-1-1 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 11-1-2 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 11-2-1 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 11-2-1 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 11-3-1 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 11-3-1 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 12-1-1 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 12-1-1 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 4 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 12-1-2 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 12-2-1 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 12-3-1 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 12-3-1 School No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 7 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Total | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 53 | 0 | 3 | 0 |
| Tolul | U | U | U | U | <i>J</i> J | J | J | 0 |



According to Table 4, the keyword "foreign student" was mentioned once in 42 strategic plans, four times in one strategic plan, seven times in one strategic plan, and the keyword "Syrian" was mentioned once in three strategic plans.

Mention of the keyword "foreign student" in strategic plans 1-1-1, 1-1-2, 1-2-1, 1-3-2, 2-1-1, 2-2-2, 2-3-2, 3-1-2, 3-2-1, 3-2-2, 4-2-2, 5-1-1, 5-1-2, 5-3-1, 5-3-2, 6-1-2, 6-2-1, 6-3-1, 6-3-2, 7-1-1, 7-2-1, 7-3-1, 7-3-2, 8-1-1, 8-2-2, 8-3-1, 8-3-2, 9-1-2, 9-2-1, 9-2-2, 9-3-1, 9-3-2, 10-1-1, 10-2-1, 10-2-2, 10-3-2, 11-1-1, 11-2-1, 11-2-2, 11-3-1, 11-3-2, 12-1-1, 12-1-2 were as follows:

Purpose 1: "Education that contributes to the social, mental, emotional and physical development of individuals and which is the most fundamental right of every individual; to provide an opportunity and environment for individuals to participate and complete under equal and fair conditions without being affected by economic, social, cultural, demographic differences and disadvantages".

Goal 1.1: "Increasing the participation of our preschool students in education and training by 5% every year by conducting field screening in our registration area".

Performance Indicator 1.1.3: The rate of foreign students who are absent for 20 days or more in an academic year (%)

In addition to the statements above, mentions of keywords in strategic plan number 12-1-2 were as follows:

Action 1.1.1: "Organizing a course seminar about what works can be done for foreign students, getting help from stakeholders"

Action 1.1.2: "Trips, sportive and cultural activities will be organized, with the participation of foreign students"

Action 1.1.4: "Interviewing parents to ensure the school attendance of foreign students"

The keyword "foreign student" was mentioned in Strategic plan no. 12-3-2 as follows:

Objective 1: An effective management structure will be established to increase the enrollment rates of children in our registration area and eliminate the compliance and absenteeism problems of the students.

Goal 1.1: "Compliance and absenteeism problems of students and foreign students in need of special education in our school will be eliminated and special measures will be taken for educational activities".

Performance Indicator 1.1.1: Number of foreign students participating in any social, cultural and sports activity

Performance Indicator 1.1.2: Number of literate foreign students



Performance Indicator 1.1.3: Number of foreign students attending Turkish speaking course

Performance Indicator 1.1.4: The ratio of foreign students in a class to the class size

Action 1.1.1: Home visits will be made to reduce absenteeism among foreign students.

Action 1.1.5: Literacy courses will be organized for foreign students.

The keyword "Syrian" was mentioned in the strategic plans 1-3-2, 10-2-1 as follows:

Under the title of SWOT (Strengths, Weaknesses, Opportunities, Threats), it was stated in the Weaknesses section as "Not having enough communication with Syrian parents".

The keyword "Syrian" was mentioned in the strategic plan 2-2-1 as follows:

Under the heading of Teacher Opinions and Evaluations Survey Form Results, it was stated that "The efforts towards solving the behavioral problems of our Syrian students should be increased".

As can be seen, when the strategic plans at school level were examined, the same sentence was used in the 42 strategic plans where the keyword "foreign students" was mentioned, and the rate of absenteeism was emphasized. In addition, a plan included the statements of organizing activities involving foreign students, interviewing the parents of these students and taking special precautions for the attendance and adaptation of these students. In the two plans examined, the term "Syrian" was taken as a weakness because it was not possible to communicate with parents, and it was stated that the efforts for these students' behavioral problems should be increased.

Works and activities carried out by school Directorates

When the works and activities carried out by the school directorates within the scope of culturally responsive education were examined, it was observed that no independent work was carried out by school principals other than the Ministry of National Education, the provincial national education or the District National Education Directorate.

Conclusion, Discussion and Recommendations

As part of this research, it has been identified that most of the strategic plans analysed contain similar expressions. This indicates that there were a number of problems in the preparation of strategic plans. Numerous research on these issues has been published in the literature. For instance, it has been stated that the individuals responsible for developing the strategic plan had conceptual difficulties (Arslan &; Kucuker, 2016; Isık &; Aypay, 2004; Memduhoglu &; Ucar, 2012). Additionally, it has been noted that the strategic plan's intended purpose is unknown and also that monitoring and evaluation were not carried out (Arabacı, Namlı, Zincirli, &; Ozer, 2015; Arslan &; Kucuker, 2016).



Another study pointed out that the participation of all teachers did not occur and the strategic plan was not utilized in the practices (Arslan &; Kucuker, 2016; Memduhoglu &; Ucar, 2012; Ozmantar, 2011). Despite this, it was discovered that teachers believe it was critical to develop a strategic plan (Yelken, Uredi, &; Kilic, 2012). Within the scope of the researches, it was revealed that there were problems in the preparation, implementation and monitoring and evaluation stages of the strategic plans.

The same sentences were included in the strategic plans examined within the scope of the research. This was an indication that the problems in the literature regarding the strategic plan still persist. However, with increasing internal and external migrations, the inability to place multicultural structures and the lack of culturally responsive educational practices also showed that the SWOT (strong, weak, opportunity, threat) analysis was not done enough from the point of view of the organization. This situation revealed the views that the actions taken were not within the strategic plans but were carried out in cases of need and necessity. The reason for this may be that the principals are inadequate in planning or lack of knowledge on this issue. Research has also shown that school administrators, in particular, feel inadequate about strategic planning (Aslan & Kucuker, 2016) and do not have sufficient knowledge about planning (Sahin & Aslan, 2008). Also, the perception that plans are imposed on schools (Aslan & Kucuker, 2016; Falcon & Lion; 2008) may have caused the planning process to become dysfunctional.

In the study, only the schooling rate of foreign students was given in the strategic plan at the level of the Ministry of Education and it was seen that this situation was covered within the scope of lifelong learning. However, in various reports in the past, it was emphasized that the characteristics of foreign students should be determined and the education environment suitable for these features should be determined or the education rights of these students should not be restricted (ERG, 2017; European Liberal Forum, 2017; Kaya, 2015). These reports also included suggestions that refugee students would adversely affect the education system and that preventive measures should be taken for this situation. Despite this, it was planned only to increase the schooling rate between 2019-2023 at the ministry level. When the works and activities were examined, it was observed that various works were done taking into account the recommendations in the reports mentioned. This indicated that the works carried out with the strategic plan were not appropriate, and the works carried out within the scope of the recommendations were not included in the strategic plan.

Another result of the study was that foreign students were seen as threats, risks or weaknesses in the education system in strategic plans studied at the provincial, district and school directorates level. According to the plans, while the increase in the number of these students at the level of provincial national education directorates was seen as a threat, it was seen as a risk that these students had to work to support their families at the level of district national education directorates. In addition, at the school level, the inability to communicate with the parents of these students was seen as a weakness. In addition, it has been stated that studies on the behaviour problems of these students should be increased at the school level. Similarly, a plan at the district level included a



statement on the social cohesion of immigrant students. In other words, Immigrants or foreign students were seen as problems within the education system. These problems can be summarized as the large number of immigrant students, economic deficiencies, inability to communicate with parents, and behaviour and adaptation problems in students. Studies have shown that immigrant or foreign students experience many problems in the education process including the language problems as the leading one (Erdem, 2017; Gungor, 2015; Nayir, 2017; Polat, 2012; Saritas, Sahin, & Catalbas, 2016; Taskin & Erdemli, 2018). The language problem is accompanied with academic failure, which in turn leads to adaptation problems (Ozturk, 2015; Saritas, Sahin, & Catalbas, 2016). The inclusion of parents in the education and training process can contribute to the solution of the problem. But in this case, the problem of communication between the parent and the school arises (Saritas, Sahin, & Catalbas, 2016).

According to the research, only strategic plans at the provincial and District National Education Level aimed at accessing to early childhood education of immigrant students, and such goals were not achieved at the school level. According to the research findings, the keyword "foreign students" has been included in the objectives of the execution of the operations of foreign students for education and training at the level of provincial and District national education directorates. Although targets have been set for the conduct of studies for foreign students, there are detailed action plans related to them. Despite this, in various studies, the problems experienced by foreign students at schools or around the school have been mentioned and various solutions have been suggested for these problems (Atac, et al., 2018; Erdem, 2017; Ertas & Kirac, 2017; Kagnici, 2017; Morali, 2018). These problems experienced by foreign students should be analyzed and necessary precautions should be taken. It is important to interpret the future that the necessary action plans are included in the strategic plan along with the determination of the problems experienced.

According to the research, only the lack of teachers for the integration of Syrian students was determined in a district-level plan, and the need for increasing the number and quality of teacher training was stated in relation to this determination. When the literature was examined, it was revealed that teachers feel inadequate in the problems that emerge during the education process of immigrant students (Aykiri, 2017, Saglam & Kanbur, 2017; Karaca & Dogan, 2014; Nayir, 2019). In other words, teachers were caught incautious for the process because they did not receive training for immigrant students (Yenilmez & Coplu, 2019). This situation causes teachers to experience different problems during the process. According to Yenilmez and Coplu (2019), teachers are anxious about not being able to prepare the program in classrooms with immigrant students, need visual materials about the lessons and have problems in the classroom management process. Erdem (2017) also revealed that teachers who have refugee students in their classrooms are not capable of using tools for these students and they need support in this regard.

In the strategic plans made at the school level, the absenteeism of foreign students was emphasized and it was stated that the activities involving foreign students were



organized, interviews with the parents of these students and special measures should be taken for the attendance and adaptation of these students. Studies showed that foreign students might be absent, susceptible to depression or misbehavior in schools (Atac, Akbay, Dobral, Demir, Ates, Ahmedzai & Hayran, 2018; Delen & Ercoskun, 2019; Saritas, Sahin, & Catalbas, 2016). These behaviours should be determined by the school administration, necessary planning should be made at the point of taking preventive measures, monitoring and evaluation processes and necessary updates should be made in line with the plan.

According to the research, many activities were carried out by the Ministry of Education, provincial and district directorates of national education for immigrant students. Most activities were planned at the ministry level, and provincial and district national education directorates followed the ministry activities. At the school level, activities in this context were not carried out. But it seemed that these educational activities were not carried out in accordance with strategic plans. In spite of this, it was stated in the MoNE strategic plan preparation program (2018a) that the slightest change in the education system affects the socio-economic order, so a strategic management approach was adopted, and strategic plans and activities should be created with participatory methods. In addition, the necessity of training the strategic plan preparation teams was also stated in the same program.

As a result, in the present study, we examined how culturally responsive education was included in the strategic plans of MoNE and what has been done in this context. When evaluated in general, within the framework of strategic plans, no target was set apart from increasing the schooling rates of foreign students and improving themselves together with other students in social, cultural or sporting ways, on the contrary, it was observed that these students were emphasized as a threat, risk or weakness of the organization. The large number of immigrant students addressed in strategic plans have to work, and the problem of adaptation among students is a problem not only for immigrant students, but also for all students. This can be treated as a reflection of the negative attitude towards immigrant or foreign students. Sakiz (2016) found that school administrators felt that immigrant students were disrupting the order in school and had a negative attitude towards these students. However, the education system and the schools involved in it have become a requirement for today's schools to accept differences and see it as an opportunity (Alton-Lee, 2003; Sakiz, 2016). At this point, it would be useful for stakeholders in the education system to adopt this situation and reflect it in their education plans. At this point, it is important for organizations to determine the work they can do in accordance with their own capabilities, to determine all the work for both foreign citizens and other students and to monitor these works with the necessary time intervals and, if necessary, to update the strategic plan. All problems, needs and differences of foreign students at the organizational level should be determined and various studies should be carried out for the development of these students and plans should be made for their inclusion in society.



Another important point in the research was that all diversity in the classroom was examined within the scope of culturally responsive education within the scope of definitions made in the literature of culturally responsive education, social and academic needs of students with differences were met and cultural values were included in the educational process. But when strategic plans were examined, it was observed that only foreign students were considered at the point of managing differences, and studies were conducted for these students. Other cultural differences within the class have been ignored.

The strategic plans under review include the same statements at the Provincial, District and school level. This can be interpreted as the fact that strategic plans were not made in accordance with their purposes. Arabaci, Namli, Zincirli, and Ozer (2015) found that participants considered strategic plans empty and useless, and thought they were not functional. Strategic planning is the work and processes that members of an organization design to achieve these predictions, in which they predict the future of the organization (Ensari, 1999). Therefore, strategic plans must be made for each organization in its own reality. Far from reality, it is expected that the plans created by organizations without analysing them will be dysfunctional (Arabaci, Namli, Zincirli, & Ozer, 2015). At this point, administrators should have sufficient knowledge of the Strategic plan, know the necessary processes and develop strategic plans considering the specific capacities and needs of their organizations by ensuring the participation of relevant stakeholders.

In this study, strategic plans covering the years 2019-2023 prepared by the Ministry of National Education, Provincial Directorate of National Education, District National Education Directorate and schools and published on the websites of the institutions and the news content published on the websites of the institutions were examined. In the present study, strategic plans were handled in line with the determined keywords. This situation constitutes the limitation of the study. In future studies, more detailed information can be obtained by obtaining the opinions of the managers regarding the strategic planning process. In this direction, strategic planning stages and conceptual development can be achieved by providing strategic planning training at various organizational levels. More detailed and accurate analyses can be made in SWOT analyses at the organization level. The strategic plan should be used as a resource in organizational progress, as all the work to be done at the organizational level determined in the strategic plan. The plan can be updated by subjecting the strategic plan to monitoring and evaluation stages at certain time intervals. Unlike increasing the schooling rate of foreign students, activities that can be carried out at organizational level can be determined and implemented as action plans in strategic plans. The social adaptation of foreign students can be achieved through various studies in the social integration of foreign students by seeing them as an opportunity in the SWOT section in the strategic plan.



Ethics Committee Approval: Since the method of this research does not include any human elements, ethic committee approval has not been required.

Informed Consent: It's not necessary

Peer-review: Externally peer-reviewed

Authors' Contributions: Concept - G. Saridas, Literature - G. Saridas, F. Nayir, Data Colletion and

Processing – G. Saridas, F. Nayir, Analysis and Interpretation – G. Saridas, F. Nayir

Conflict of Interests: No conflict of interest

Financial Disclosure: This study has received no financial support.



References

- Alton-Lee, A. (2003). Quality teaching for diverse students in schooling: Best evidence synthesis. Ministry of Education.
- APA. (2002). Guidelines on multicultural education, training, research, practice, and organizational change for psychologists. http://www.apa.org/pi/multiculturalguidelines/homepage.html
- Arabacı, İ. B., Namlı, A., Zincirli, M., & Ozer, F. (2015). Egitim kurumlarının stratejik plan gelistirme ve uygulama surecinde karsılastıkları sorunlar ve cozum onerileri. K.U. Kastamonu Egitim Dergisi, 23(4), 1453-1470.
- Arslan, G., & Kucuker, E. (2016). Okul mudurlerinin planlama etkinlikleri ve stratejik planlamada karsılasılan sorunlar. Kastamonu Egitim Dergisi, 24(2), 839-856.
- Aykırı, K. (2017). Sınıf ogretmenlerinin sınıflarındaki Suriyeli ogrencilerin egitim durumlarına iliskin gorusleri. Turkish Journal of Primary Education, 2, 44-56.
- Atac, O., Akbay, H., Dobral, A., Demir, S., Ates, B. S., Ahmedzai, S., & Hayran, O. E. (2018). Multeci ve yerlesik ergenlerde depresyona yatkınlık ve algılanan sosyal destek duzeyleri. Anadolu Klin, 23(3), 129-136.
- Basaran, İ. E. & Cınkır, S. (2011). Turk egitim sistemi ve okul yonetimi. Ankara: Ekinoks Yayınları.
- Cirik, İ. (2008). Cokkulturlu egitim ve yansımaları. Hacettepe Universitesi Egitim Fakultesi Dergisi, 34, 27-40.
- Creswell, J. W. (2013). Qualitative inquiry & research design: Choosing among five approaches (3rd ed.). Thousand Oaks, Sage.
- Delen, A., & Ercoskun, M. H. (2019). Yabancı uyruklu ogrencilerin bulundugu ilkokullarda istenmeyen ogrenci davranıslarının nitel acıdan incelenmesi. Milli Egitim, 48(223), 299- 322.
- Ensari, H. (1999). 21. Yuzyıl okulları icin toplam kalite yonetimi. Sistem Yayıncılık.
- Erdem, C. (2017). Sınıfında multeci ogrenci bulunan sınıf ogretmenlerinin yasadıkları Ogretimsel sorunlar ve cozume dair onerileri. Medeniyet Egitim Arastırmaları Dergisi, 1(1), 26-42.
- Eren, E.(2000). İsletmelerde stratejik planlama. Beta Basım Yayımcılık.
- ERG. (2017). Bir arada yasamı ve gelecegi kapsayıcı egitimle insa etmek. ERG.
- Ertas, H., & Kırac, F. C. (2017). Turkiye'de suriyeli gocmenlere yonelik yapılan egitim calısmaları. Selcuk Universitesi Sosyal ve Teknik Arastırmalar Dergisi(13), 99-110.
- European Liberal Forum. (2017). Turkiye'de multeci cocukların egitim hakkını ve karsılıklı uyumu destekleyen yaklasımlar, politikalar. Avrupa Liberal Forumu.
- European Commission/EACEA/Eurydice, (2019) . Integrating Students from Migrant Backgrounds in to Schools in Europe: National Policies and Measures. Eurydice Report. Publications Office of the European Union.
- Gay, G. (2002). Preparing for culturally responsive teaching. Journal of Teacher Education, 53(2), 106-
- Gay, G., & Howard, T. C. (2000). Multicultural teacher education for the 21st century. The Teacher Educator, 36(1), 1-16. https://doi.org/10.1080/08878730009555246
- Guba, E. G., & Lincoln, Y. S. (2005). Paradigmatic controversies, contradictions and emerging confluences. In. N. K. Denzin ve Y. S. Lincoln (Ed.). The Sage Handbook of Qualitative Research (Third Edition). (s. 191-216). Thousands Oaks, SAGE Publications, Inc.
- Gungor, F. (2015). Yabancı uyruklu ilkokul ogrencilerinin egitim-ogretiminde yasanan sorunlara iliskin ogretmen ve ogrenci gorusleri. (Yayımlanmamıs Yuksek lisans Tezi). Anadolu Universitesi Egitim Bilimleri Enstitusu, Eskisehir.
- Istanbul MEM. (2019, Nisan). Multeci cocuklar icin kapsayıcı egitim projesi. Mayıs 11, 2020 tarihinde Istanbul MEM: http://lstanbul.meb.gov.tr/www/multeci-cocuklar-icin-kapsayici egitim/icerik/2480
- Istanbul MEM. (2020, Subat). Cokkulturlu ve cok dilli kafe. https://lstanbul.meb.gov.tr/meb_iys_dosyalar/2020_02/08113445_10 16_Subat_2020.pdf adresinden alındı



- Isık, H., & Aypay, A. (2004). Egitimde stratejik plan gelistirme surecinde karsılasılan sorunlar: Canakkale ilinde yapılan bir inceleme. Gazi Egitim Fakultesi Dergisi, 24(3), 349-363.
- Kagnıcı, D. Y. (2017). Suriyeli multeci cocukların kulturel uyum surecinde okul psikolojik danısmanlarına dusen rol ve sorumluluklar. İlkogretim Online, 16(4), 1768-1776.
- Kamuda Stratejik Yonetim. (2018). Kılavuz ve rehberler. http://www.sp.gov.tr/upload/xSpKutuphane/files/VrllQ+Kamu_Idareleri_Icin_Stratejik_P lanlama_Kilavuzu.pdf
- Karaca, S. & Dogan, U. (2014). Suriyeli gocmenlerin sorunları calıstayı sonuc raporu. Mersin Universitesi Bolgesel İzleme Uygulama Arastırma Merkezi.
- Karasar, N. (2000). Bilimsel arastırma yontemi (10. Baskı b.). Nobel Yayın Dagıtım.
- Karakutuk, K. (2012). Egitim planlaması. Elhan Kitap.
- Kastoryano, R. (2018). Multiculturalism and interculturalism: redefining nationhood and solidarity. Kastoryano Comparative Migration Studies, 6(17), 1-11. https://doi.org/10.1186/s40878-018-0082-6
- Kaya, N. (2015). Turkiye egitim Sisteminde renk, etnik koken, dil, din ve inanc temelli ayrımcılık. Tarih Vakfı.
- KONDA. (2006). Biz kimiz?,Toplumsal yapı arastırması. Konda Arastırma ve Danısmanlık: http://www.konda.com.tr/tr/raporlar/2006_09_KONDA_Toplumsal_Yapi.pdf
- Kotluk, N. ve Kocakaya, S. (2018). Turkiye icin alternatif bir anlayıs: Kulturel degerlere duyarlı egitim, YYU Egitim Fakultesi Dergisi (YYU Journal of Education Faculty), 15(1), 749-789.
- Kucuker, E. (2010). Turkiye'de egitim planlaması neyi hedefliyor? International Conference on New Trends in Education and Their Implications, 153-157.
- Ladson-Billings, G. (1992). Culturally relevant teaching: The key to making multicultural education work. C. A. Grant icinde, Research In Multicultural Education (s. 106-121). Falmer Press.
- MEB. (2017). Sınıfında Yabancı Uyruklu Ogrenci Bulunan Ogretmenler Icin El Kitabı. MEB.
- MEB. (2018, Eylul 19). 2019-2023 Stratejik Planlama Genelgesi. MEB: https://sgb.meb.gov.tr/www/2019-2023-stratejik-plani-genelgesi-yayinlanmistir/icerik/329
- MEB. (2018a). 2019-2023 Stratejik Plan Hazırlık Programı. Strateji Gelistirme Baskanlıgı: https://sgb.meb.gov.tr/meb_iys_dosyalar/2018_09/19150513_Ek-1 HazYrlYk ProgramY.pdf
- MEB. (2019, Ocak 1). 2019-2023 Stratejik planı. Strateji Gelistirme Baskanlıgı:
 http://sgb.meb.gov.tr/meb_iys_dosyalar/2019_12/31105532_Milli_EYitim_BakanlYYY_2019
 2023_Stratejik_PlanY__31.12.pdf
- MEB. (2019a, Ocak 7). Yabancı uyruklu ogrenciler icin universitelerle isbirligi. Milli Egitim Bakanlıgı: http://www.meb.gov.tr/yabanci-uyruklu-ogrenciler-icin-universitelerle-is- birligi/haber/17804/tr
- MEB. (2019b). MEB Genelge. MEB: http://mevzuat.meb.gov.tr/dosyalar/2022.pdf
- MEB. (2019c, Temmuz). Okul oncesi egitim erisimi olmayan 40 bin cocuga anaokulu egitimi. Milli Egitim Bakanlıgı: http://www.meb.gov.tr/okul-oncesi- egitime-erisimi-olmayan- 40-bin-cocuga-anaokulu-egitimi/haber/19003/tr
- MEB. (2019d, Eylul). Kriz zamanlarında herkes icin egitim projesi kapsamında 180 yeni okul. Milli Egitim Bakanlıgı: https://www.meb.gov.tr/kriz-zamanlarında-herkes-icin-egitim- projesi-kapsaminda-180-yeni-okul/haber/19332/tr
- MEB. (2019e, Eylul). Rehberlikte dijital donem baslıyor. Milli Egitim Bakanlıgı: https://www.meb.gov.tr/rehberlikte-dijital-donem-basliyor/haber/19399/tr
- MEB. (2019f, 2019 Mart). QUDRA Programı, cokkulturlu egitim ortamlarında yoneticilik farkındalık egitimi. Milli Egitim Bakanlıgı: https://hbogm.meb.gov.tr/www/qudra-programi-cokkulturlu-egitim-ortamlarinda-yoneticilik-farkindalik-egitimi/icerik/895
- MEB. (2020). Kapsayıcı Egitim Baglamında Okul Ve Okul Yoneticiligi Kitabı. MEB.
- MEB. (2020a, Ocak). Multeci cocukların egitim kazandırılması icin destek programı. MEB: https://www.meb.gov.tr/multeci-cocuklarin-egitime-kazandirilmasi-icin-destek programi/haber/20068/tr



- MEB. (2020b, Ocak), Internet bulteni. MEB: https://hbogm.meb.gov.tr/meb_iys_dosyalar/2020_01/27110237_OCAK_2020internet_Bulten iSunu.pdf
- Memduhoglu, H. B., & Ucar, İ. H. (2012). Yonetici ve ogretmenlerin stratejik planlama algısı ve okullarda mevcut stratejik planlama uygulamalarının degerlendirilmesi. MAEU Egitim Fakultesi Dergisi (23), 234-256.
- Merriam, S. B., & Tisdell, E. J. (2015). Qualitative research: A guide to design and implementation (Fourth Edition). Jossey Bass.
- Moralı, G. (2018). Suriyeli multeci cocuklara turkcenin yabancı dil olarak ogretiminde karsılasılan sorunlar. Uluslararası Toplum Arastırmaları Dergisi, 8(15), 1426-1449.
- Nayir, F. (2017). Problems and suggested solutions during refugee education process. In Innovation and Global Issues in Social Sciences Sciences, 27-29 April, Patara, Antalya-Turkiye, 120-122.
- Nayir, F. (2019). Gocmen ogrencilerle birlikte olmak: yaraları, zorluklar ve destek ihtiyacları, II. Uluslararası Egitimde ve Kulturde Akademik Calısmalar Sempozyumu, 12-14 Eylul, Denizli. (Tam Metin).
- Ozmantar, Z. K. (2011). Okullarda etkili stratejik plan hazırlama sureci: Bir eylem arastırması. Gaziantep Universitesi Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi, 10(4), 1389-1421.
- Polat, F. (2012). Turkiye'de ogrenim goren yabancı uyruklu ilkogretim ogrencilerinin karsılastıkları sorunlar ve cozum onerileri. (Yayınlanmamıs Yuksek lisans Tezi). Fırat Universitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitusu, Elazıg.
- Resnicow, K., Soler, R., Braithwaite, R. L., Ahluwalia, J. S., & Butler, J. (2000). Cultural sensitivty in substance use prevention. Journal Of Community Psychology, 28(3), 271-290. 10.1016/j.cct.2018.12.011
- Saglam, H.İ. & Kanbur, N.İ. (2017). Sınıf ogretmenlerinin multeci ogrencilere yonelik tutumlarının cesitli degiskenler acısından incelenmesi. Sakarya University Journal of Education, 7(2), 310-323
- Sakiz, H. (2016). Gocmen cocuklar ve okul kulturleri: Bir butunlestirme calısması. Goc Dergisi, 3(1), 65-81. https://doi.org/10.33182/gd.v3i1.555
- Saridas, G., & Nayir, F. (2020). Kulturel Degerlere Duyarlı Egitim ve Uygulama Ornekleri. F. Nayir (Du.) icinde, Kulturel Degerlere Duyarlı Egitim. Anı Yayıncılık.
- Sarıtas, E., Sahin, U., & Catalbas, G. (2016). İlkokullarda yabancı uyruklu ogrencilerle karsılasılan sorunlar. Pamukkale Universitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitusu Dergisi, 25(1), 208-229.
- Shenton, A. K. (2004). Strategies for ensuring trustworthiness in qualitative research projects. Education for Information, 22(2), 63-75
- Sinop ARGE. (2019, Ocak). Medeniyetler koprusu projesi. Sinop ARGE: http://sinoparge.meb.gov.tr/meb_iys_dosyalar/2020_01/14103953_Medeniyet_Koprus u Projesi.pdf
- Siverek MEM. (2019, Ekim). Yabancı uyruklu ogrenciler icin destekleme egitimi. Siverek MEM: https://siverek.meb.gov.tr/meb iys dosyalar/2019 10/23164047 DENKLEME.pdf
- Sahin, S. & Aslan, N. (2008). İlkogretim okul yoneticilerinin stratejik planlamaya iliskin gorus- leri uzerine nitel bir calısma (Gaziantep İli Ornegi). Gaziantep Universitesi, Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi, 7 (1), 172-189
- Sengul, U., Eslemian, S., & Eren, M. (2013). Turkiye'de İstatistikî bolge birimleri sınıflamasına gore duzey 2 bolgelerinin ekonomik etkinliklerinin vza yontemi ile belirlenmesi ve tobit model uygulaması. Yonetim Bilimleri Dergisi, 11(21), 75-99.
- Taskin, P. ve Erdemli, O. (2018). Education for syrian refugees: Problems faced by teachers in Turkey. Eurasian Journal of Educational Research. 75, 155-178.
- Thompson, A., Strickland, A. J. (1996). Strategic management Concepts & Cases. Irwin Mcgraw Hill Publishing.
- Trabzon ARGE. (2019, Eylul). Kapsayıcı egitim ile kurulacak kulturlerarası kopruler. Trabzon ARGE: http://trabzonarge.meb.gov.tr/www/kapsayici-egitim-ile-kurulacak-kopruler/icerik/540
- UNHCR. (2019, Temmuz). UNHCR BM Multeci orgutu. UNHCR Turkiye İstatistikleri: https://www.unhcr.org/tr/unhcr-turkiye-istatistikleri



Yelken, T. Y., Uredi, L., & Kilic, F. (2012). Stratejik planlama uygulamalarına iliskin ilk ve orta ogretim okulu ogretmenlerinin goruslerinin incelenmesi. Milli Egitim Dergisi(195), 67-91.

Yenilmez, K. & Coplu, F. (2019). Gocmen ogrencilerin egitiminde ogretmenlerin karsılastıkları zorluklar. Egitim ve Ogretim Arastırmaları Dergisi, 8(3), 25-36.

Yildirim, A., Simsek H. (2013). Nitel arastırma yontemleri. Seckin Yayıncılık.

Authors

Gurkan SARİDAS is PhD student of educational management and has a background in mathematics teaching. His research interests are in professional development, educational management, multicultural education, and culturally responsive education.

Funda NAYIR is an Assoc. Prof of Educational Management and has a background in teacher proffession. Her research interests are in educational management and supervision and teacher training. She also has expertise in culturally responsive education and assessment. She was a visiting researcher in Dublin City University for 3 months. She has published in the fields of organizational behaviour, teacher culturally training, responsive assessment, inclusive education, school management, both qualitative and quantitative studies. She has been co-PI on the Erasmus + project 'Aiding Culturally Responsive Assessment in School' (Project number: 2016-1-IE01-KA201-016889). supervises master's and PhD students in the Department of Educational Administration, Supervision, Planning and Economics.

Contact

Gurkan SARİDAS, Hurriyet Secondary School, Pamukkale, Denizli, TURKEY.

E-mail: theapeiron@gmail.com

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Funda NAYIR, Pamukkale University, Faculty of Education, Pamukkale, Denizli, TURKEY.

E-mail: fnayir09@gmail.com